

Mazerolle, L., E. Antrobus, et al. (2013). "Shaping Citizen Perceptions of Police Legitimacy: A Randomized Field Trial of Procedural Justice Shaping Citizen Perceptions of Police Legitimacy: A Randomized Field Trial of Procedural Justice." *Criminology* 51(1): 33-63.

- This article examines both the direct and the indirect outcomes of procedural justice policing, tested under randomized field trial conditions.
- The authors assess whether police can enhance perceptions of legitimacy during a short, police-initiated and procedurally just traffic encounter and how this single encounter shapes general views of police.
- The results show significant differences between the control and experimental conditions:
 - Procedurally just traffic encounters with police (experimental condition) shape citizen views about the actual encounter directly and general orientations toward the police relative to business-as-usual traffic stops in the control group.
 - The theorized model is supported by the authors research, demonstrating that the police have much to gain from acting fairly during even short encounters with citizens.

Mazerolle, L., S. Bennett, et al. (2013). *Legitimacy in Policing: A Systematic Review*. Oslo, Norway, Campbell Systematic Reviews. 2013:1.¹

- The authors review shows that the dialogue component of front-line police-led interventions is important for promoting:
 - Citizen satisfaction
 - Confidence
 - Compliance and cooperation with the police, and
 - For enhancing perceptions of procedural justice.
- In practical terms, this means that police can achieve positive changes in citizen attitudes to police through adopting procedurally justice dialogue as a component part of any type of police intervention.
- The authors conclude that the type of police intervention (the vehicle for delivering a procedurally just encounter) is secondary to the procedurally just dialogue that underpins the intervention.

Elliott, I., S. D. M. Thomas, et al. (2012). "Procedural Justice in Contacts with the Police: The Perspective of Victims of Crime." *Police Practice & Research* 13(5): 437-449.

- This study examined perceptions of procedural justice (the fairness of methods used to achieve outcomes) in contacts with the police among victims of crime.
- In-depth interviews were conducted with 110 people who reported a crime (personal and property) to the police in the previous 12 months.
- The findings indicated that police willingness to do their best to solve the case and police relating to victims as persons independently of the case itself were at least as important to victims of crime as the police delivering a desired outcome.

¹ <http://campbellcollaboration.org/lib/download/2604/>

Gau, J. M., N. Corsaro, et al. (2012). "Examining Macro-Level Impacts on Procedural Justice and Police Legitimacy." *Journal of Criminal Justice* 40(4): 333-343.

- This study integrates the macro-level policing literature with the psychological-based procedural justice framework to uncover what effects, if any, the socio-structural environment has on procedural justice and police legitimacy.
- Results: Procedural justice remained the strongest predictor of legitimacy, even when accounting for macro-level characteristics.
- Conclusions: The effect of procedural justice on police legitimacy appears to be robust against the deleterious impacts of concentrated disadvantage.

Dai, M., J. Frank, et al. (2011). "Procedural Justice During Police-Citizen Encounters: The Effects of Process-Based Policing on Citizen Compliance and Demeanor." *Journal of Criminal Justice* 39(2): 159-168.

- The study examines whether procedurally fair behavior by the police affects two types of citizen behavior during encounters: citizen disrespect toward the police and citizen noncompliance with police requests.
- Methods: This study uses data from systematic social observations of police-citizen encounters to examine procedural justice factors on citizen behavior.
- Results: The statistical analyses find limited support for procedural justice factors. Two types of procedurally fair behavior by the police, police demeanor and their consideration of citizen voice, are significant in reducing citizen disrespect and noncompliance, respectively.
- Conclusion: Procedural justice factors have limited and inconsistent impacts on the two types of citizen behavior, and future research should address the limitations of this study and evaluate process-based policing with more data from social observations of police-citizen encounters.

Gau, J. M. and R. K. Brunson (2010). "Procedural Justice and Order Maintenance Policing: A Study of Inner-City Young Men's Perceptions of Police Legitimacy." *JQ: Justice Quarterly* 27(2): 255-279.

- Research has shown that citizens' perceptions of procedural justice influence their beliefs about police legitimacy, yet at the same time, some order maintenance policing efforts stress frequent stops of vehicles and persons for suspected disorderly behavior.
- These types of programs can threaten citizens' perceptions of police legitimacy because the targeted offenses are minor and are often not well-defined.
- Citizens stopped for low-level offenses may view such stops as a form of harassment, as they may not believe they were doing anything to warrant police scrutiny.
- This paper examines young men's self-described experiences with this style of proactive policing.
- Study findings highlight that order maintenance policing strategies have negative implications for police legitimacy and crime control efforts via their potential to damage citizens' views of procedural justice.

Weisburd, D., J. C. Hinkle, et al. (2011). "Possible Backfire: Effects of Hot Spots Policing: An Experimental Assessment of Impacts on Legitimacy, Fear and Collective Efficacy." *Journal of Experimental Criminology* 7(4): 297 - 320.

- This article used a randomized experimental design to test the impact of broken windows based hot spots policing.
- To examine the impacts of broken windows policing at crime hot spots on fear of crime, ratings of police legitimacy and reports of collective efficacy among residents of targeted hot spots - a block randomized experimental design with a police intervention targeting disorder delivered to 55 treatment street segments with an equal number of segments serving as controls.

- Main outcomes were measured using a panel survey of 371 persons living or working in these sites.
- The broken windows police intervention delivered to crime hot spots in this study had no significant impacts on fear of crime, police legitimacy, collective efficacy, or perceptions of crime or social disorder.
- Perceptions of physical disorder appear to have been modestly increased in the target areas.
- The findings suggest that recent criticisms of hot spots policing approaches which focus on possible negative backfire effects for residents of the targeted areas may be overstated.
- This study shows that residents are not aware of, or much affected by, a three hour per week dosage of aggressive order maintenance policing on their blocks (in addition to routine police responses in these areas).

Willis, J. J. (2011). "Enhancing Police Legitimacy by Integrating Compstat and Community Policing." *Policing: An International Journal of Police Strategies & Management* 34(4): 654-673.

- The purpose of this article is to examine how Compstat and community policing, two of the most highly-touted police reforms to have emerged in the US over the last 25 years, might be integrated to help enhance police organizational legitimacy.
- This article suggests three possible ways for police organizations to develop public trust and support:
 - Systematic reporting of community problems at Compstat meetings
 - Involving the community in problem-solving efforts; and
 - Using Compstat maps and statistics to help mitigate perceptions of unfairness
- Identifying some different ways that Compstat and community policing may help foster favorable social judgments of police organizations could lead law enforcement agencies to reconsider how these reforms are currently co-implemented in their departments.
- A more integrated Compstat and community policing model could potentially contribute to fairer and more responsive policing practices.

Wolfe, S. E. (2011). "The Effect of Low Self-Control on Perceived Police Legitimacy." *Journal of Criminal Justice* 39(1): 67-74.

- The current study fills a void in the literature by examining the effect of low self-control on individuals' procedural justice judgments and perceptions of police legitimacy.
- The findings demonstrate that low self-control is associated with unfavorable procedural justice judgments. In turn, procedural justice mediates the effect of low self-control on perceived police legitimacy.
- Low self-control, however, is also shown to condition the effect of procedural justice on legitimacy. Specifically, the effect of procedural justice on legitimacy becomes weaker with reduced levels of self-control.
- Conclusions: These findings suggest that studies should account for self-control in process-based policing research and police policy should consider the impact of individual differences when implementing process-based strategies.

Weisburd, D., J. C. Hinkle, et al. (2010). *Legitimacy, Fear and Collective Efficacy in Crime Hot Spots: Assessing the Impacts of Broken Windows Policing Strategies on Citizen Attitudes*. Washington, DC, National Institute of Justice.²

² <https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/grants/239971.pdf>

- This study examined the impacts of broken windows policing at crime hot spots on the public's fear of crime, ratings of police legitimacy, and reports of collective efficacy among residents of targeted hot spots.
- The broken windows thesis (Wilson & Kelling, 1982) suggests that the benefit of eliminating visual signs of social disorder and neglect in hot spots areas (areas where particular types of crime are concentrated) is that residents will over time feel safer and be empowered to exercise informal social controls that control disorderly and criminal behavior at hot spots.
- The findings do not support the belief that broken windows policing at hot spots will significantly reduce levels of fear of crime among people who live on the targeted streets. Neither was there an improvement among residents regarding police legitimacy, but neither did it undermine views of police.
- There was no impact on collective efficacy (improved community involvement in crime prevention).

Flexon, J. L., A. J. Lurigio, et al. (2009). "Exploring the Dimensions of Trust in the Police among Chicago Juveniles." *Journal of Criminal Justice* 37(2): 180-189.

- This study examined the relationship between youths' trust in the police and their attitudes, beliefs, experiences, behaviors, and background characteristics.
- The investigation found that trust in the police was a multidimensional construct.
- The study also found a relationship between vicarious experiences and trust and evidence for the negativity or asymmetrical bias that has appeared in previous studies of police-citizen contacts.

Hinds, L. (2009). "Youth, Police Legitimacy and Informal Contact." *Journal of Police and Criminal Psychology* 24(1): 10-21.

- This paper explores the under-researched topic of young people's attitudes towards police in two studies using structural equation modeling.
- The first study examines the influence of police legitimacy on the willingness of young people to assist police.
- The second study examines the impact of informal contact with police during a community policing project on young people's willingness to assist police.
- Findings show that young people who view police as legitimate are more willing to assist police.
- Participation in the community policing project had a significant and positive influence on young people's willingness to assist police independent of young people's attitudes about police legitimacy.

Hart, B., R. Toon, et al. (2007). *Confidence and Caution: Arizonans' Trust in the Police. Temple, AZ, Morrison Institute for Public Policy: 47.*³

- This study examined Arizonans' trust in police by reviewing national and Arizona-focused research literature; analyzing the results of 10 focus groups across the State; and providing the findings of a random-sample opinion poll of all Arizona adults.
- The majority of focus group participants said they trusted police, but group discussions revealed a significant undercurrent of wariness. This was evident in frequently expressed concerns about officer rudeness, arrogance, non-responsiveness, bias, and the use of excessive force.
- Focus group suggestions for improving officer performance were training in proper officer demeanor in interacting with the public; making officers more visible to residents through such

³ <http://morrisoninstitute.asu.edu/publications-reports/ConfAndCaution-AzTrustInPolice>

means as foot or bike patrols; promoting more involvement of officers with the community in nonthreatening or non-intimidating circumstances; hiring and maintaining a more diverse force; and offering more credible, responsive avenues for citizen complaints.

Hinds, L. (2007). "Building Police--Youth Relationships: The Importance of Procedural Justice." *Youth Justice* 7(3): 195-209.

- A consistent body of research shows that a key reason that adults support police is that they view them as legitimate.
- This study used data from a written survey of 14 to 16 year-old high school students.
- Findings show that young people's attitudes toward police legitimacy are positively linked to police use of procedural justice.
- Prior negative contact with police is significantly associated with young people's judgments of lower police legitimacy.

Horowitz, J. (2007). "Making Every Encounter Count: Building Trust and Confidence in the Police." *National Institute of Justice Journal* (256): 8-11.⁴

- This article presents the findings of five projects funded by the U.S. Justice Department's National Institute of Justice (NIJ) that explored factors related to citizen satisfaction with the police.
- The findings of these studies indicate that citizen satisfaction with the police is shaped by:
 - Demographic variables
 - Neighborhood crime conditions, and
 - Experiences with the police (whether firsthand or indirect).
- The findings suggest that the first step in building good relations with the community is to analyze and respond to citizens' expectations of police across a range of types of police-citizen encounters.
- Race was not found to be a direct factor in citizen satisfaction with police. Due to its correlation with other demographic variables, neighborhood crime rates, and experiences with police, race was an indirect influence on the level of satisfaction with police.
- When people form opinions about the police based on their interactions with them, citizens tend to focus on the quality of the interaction process more than the outcome. This pertains to the officer's:
 - Demeanor
 - Clarity of communication
 - Respectfulness, and
 - Fairness.
- Citizen's currently held attitudes toward police were found to play a critical role in determining their judgments about police in subsequent interactions with police.

MacDonald, J. and R. J. Stokes (2006). "Race, Social Capital, and Trust in the Police." *Urban Affairs Review* 41(3): 358-375.

- In this study, the authors hypothesize that the construct of social capital offers a nexus for explaining racial differences in attitudes toward the police.
- They measured social capital as a construct by aggregating together measures that assess the degree of trust and civic engagement in communities.
- The results indicate that depleted levels of perceived community social capital contribute to higher levels of distrust of local police.

⁴ <http://www.ojp.usdoj.gov/nij/journals/256/building-trust.html>

- Social capital, however, partially mediates the relative distrust of Blacks toward the police.
- These findings suggest only partial support for a social capital explanation of Blacks' distrust in the police.

Kane, R. J. (2005). "Compromised Police Legitimacy as a Predictor of Violent Crime in Structurally Disadvantaged Communities." *Criminology* 43(2): 469-498.

- This study examined whether indicators of compromised police legitimacy explained variations in violent crime within New York City police precincts from 1975 to 1996.
- Integrating models of urban cultural attenuation and procedural justice, the study hypothesized that variations in patterns of police misconduct and over/under policing (the indicators of police legitimacy) would predict variations in violent crime rates of communities characterized by concentrated structural disadvantage.
- The study found that in communities characterized by high disadvantage, incidents of police misconduct predicted variations in violent crime.
- In communities characterized by extreme disadvantage, both indicators of compromised police legitimacy (misconduct and over policing) predicted variations in violent crime.
- The study found no significant relationships between the indicators of police legitimacy and violent crime in communities of low disadvantage.
- Findings support emerging arguments that emphasize the importance of formal institutions of social control in the most structurally disadvantaged communities (that is, those often subjected to cultural attention) and suggest implications for the ecology of crime model and police accountability.

Lacks, R. D. and J. A. Gordon (2005). "Adults and Adolescents: The Same or Different? Exploring Police Trust in an Inner-City, Adolescent Population." *Criminal Justice Studies: A Critical Journal of Crime, Law and Society* 18(3): 271 - 280.

- This study explored the issue of police trust in a sample of 69 adolescents residing in low income, high crime communities in Richmond, VA.
- While a plethora of criminological research has focused on the deleterious outcomes associated with residing in socially disorganized, inner-city communities, relatively little research attention has focused on perceptions and trust in police officers displayed by inner-city adolescents.
- Previous research on police trust with adult populations has revealed its multi-faceted nature and has also revealed a high degree of mistrust of police within minority urban communities.
- The results indicate that adolescents in high crime minority communities respect police officers and think they are doing a good job. T
- These findings highlight the differences between adolescent's and adult's perceptions of police.

Tyler, T. R. (2005). "Policing in Black and White: Ethnic Group Differences in Trust and Confidence in the Police." *Police Quarterly* 8(3): 322-342.

- This study used a sample of New Yorkers to examine, first, whether trust is related to public willingness to cooperate with the police; and second, this study examines the relationship of police policies and practices to trust in the police.
- The study found that trust is most strongly influenced by public judgments about the fairness of the procedures that the police follow when exercising their authority.
- These process-based judgments are more influential than are either assessments of the effectiveness of police crime-control activities or judgments about the fairness of the police distribution of services.

Tyler, T. R. (2004). "Enhancing Police Legitimacy." *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 593: 84-99.

- This article makes three points:
 - The police need public support & cooperation to be effective in their order-maintenance role, & they particularly benefit when they have the voluntary support & cooperation of most members of the public, most of the time.
 - Such voluntary support & cooperation is linked to judgments about the legitimacy of the police. A central reason people cooperate with the police is that they view them as legitimate legal authorities, entitled to be obeyed.
 - A key antecedent of public judgments about the legitimacy of the police & of policing activities involves public assessments of the manner in which the police exercise their authority. Such procedural-justice judgments are central to public evaluations of the police & influence such evaluations separately from assessments of police effectiveness in fighting crime.
- These findings suggest the importance of enhancing public views about the legitimacy of the police & suggest process-based strategies for achieving that objective.

Tyler, T. R. and C. J. Wakslak (2004). "Profiling and Police Legitimacy: Procedural Justice, Attributions of Motive, and Acceptance of Police Authority." *Criminology* 42(2): 253-281.

- This paper reports the results of four studies that investigate racial profiling as an attribution about police motives.
- Each study explores, first, the types of police behavior that heighten or lessen the occurrence of profiling attributions and, second, the consequences of such attributions.
- Results support prior studies in finding that judgments about whether the police are profiling are associated with the level of public support for the police.
- The findings support the procedural justice hypothesis that the fairness with which the police exercise their authority influences whether members of the public view the police as profiling.

Hawdon, J. E., J. Ryan, et al. (2003). "Policing Tactics and Perceptions of Police Legitimacy." *Police Quarterly* 6(4): 469-491.

- Research indicates that community policing can improve citizen perceptions of the police.
- However, does community policing improve citizen perceptions of the police or is this improvement simply due to increased police visibility?
- Survey data from 1,347 residents from 41 South Carolina neighborhoods are used to determine whether policing tactics commonly associated with community policing influence resident perceptions of the police.
- Regression analysis indicates that police visibility results in improved resident perceptions.

Maxson, C., K. Hennigan, et al. (2003). *Factors That Influence Public Opinion of the Police*. Washington, DC, National Institute of Justice.⁵

- Police can improve public opinion by increasing their informal contacts with citizens.
- According to a survey of Los Angeles residents' opinions of police job performance and officers' demeanor, police can increase residents' approval of their job performance by participating in community meetings, increasing officers' visibility in neighborhoods, and talking with citizens.

⁵ <https://www.ncjrs.gov/pdffiles1/nij/197925.pdf>

- Such informal contacts had a positive impact on job approval ratings even when other factors associated with lower approval ratings— such as residents’ perceptions that their neighborhoods are crime ridden, dangerous, and disorderly—were present.

Sunshine, J. and T. R. Tyler (2003). "The Role of Procedural Justice and Legitimacy in Shaping Public Support for Policing." *Law & Society Review* 37(3): 513-547.

- This study explores two issues about police legitimacy:
 - The relative importance of police legitimacy in shaping public support of the police
 - Policing activities, compared to the importance of instrumental judgments about (1) the risk that people will be caught & sanctioned for wrongdoing, (2) the performance of the police in fighting crime, &/or (3) the fairness of the distribution of police services.
- Three aspects of public support for the police are examined:
 - Public compliance with the law
 - Public cooperation with the police, &
 - Public willingness to support policies that empower the police
- The second issue is which judgments about police activity determine people's views about the legitimacy of the police.
- This study compares the influence of people's judgments about the procedural justice of the manner in which the police exercise their authority to the influence of three instrumental judgments: risk, performance, & distributive fairness.
- Findings of the two surveys of New Yorkers show that:
 - Legitimacy has a strong influence on the public's reactions to the police
 - The key antecedent of legitimacy is the fairness of the procedures used by the police.

Stoutland, S. E. (2001). "Multiple Dimensions of Trust in Resident/Police Relations in Boston." *Journal of Research in Crime and Delinquency* 38(3): 226-56.

- This article examines the nature of trust in relations between residents and police in Boston, MA.
- The article attempts to determine what it is about resident/police relations in poor urban communities that results in many community members' deep distrust of police.
- Many residents considered that police met their expectations of competence and dependability but not of shared priorities or respect.
- Respect, in particular was important to residents, although they recognized a tension between police acting competently and respectfully.